

If a canoe can be carved from every log why can't a log be carved into every canoe?

Paul Kay

Abstract: A long-standing puzzle is posed by a constellation of facts emanating from paradigms like the one illustrated in (1) -- most influentially discussed by Chuck Fillmore, who attributes the original examples to Jeffrey Gruber.

- (1) a. Every log was carved into a canoe.
- b. Every canoe was carved from a log.
- c. A canoe was carved from every log.
- d. *A log was carved into every canoe.

This talk is not going to solve the puzzle, but it may cast some light on it. The guiding observation will be the fact that the star on 1d pertains only to the injective (one-to-one into) reading, that is, the reading according to which each canoe of the lot under consideration was carved from a different log. (Some people say that 1d is acceptable under another reading, which is more readily apparent in (2). In any case, that reading is irrelevant to the puzzle.)

- (2) [Imagine!] All those canoes were carved from one immense log.

The task of the puzzle-solver is to explain why an injective reading is available for 1a,b,c, but not for (1d).